

Peer review 2010

Your task is to read the work you are given critically, comment and set a grade according to the system high pass, pass or fail (or a letter grade if you want). You motivate your grade in writing, c. one page. Sign your number to your evaluation, e.g., 'Peer review by student # 54 of paper written by student #42'.

When you are evaluating/grading, keep the following points in mind:

- Did the writer state his/her aim with the paper
- Did he/she present the point/argument/topic clearly?
- Did s/he use all the relevant literature? Was there a bibliography?
- Did s/he use adequate footnotes?
- Was the paper explanatory/analytical or merely descriptive (=a review of the historical events with no analysis)? Did the author have his/her own ideas?
- Did s/he give examples from the material culture to support his/her ideas?
- Did s/he have a conclusion based on his/her own presentation and ideas? Did the conclusion answer the problem stated in the beginning?
- Was the paper 3 full pages of text?
- Was it logical in its structure?
- Other things that aren't mentioned here but that you notice/feel are important.

If the author did all of the above well, had a good answer, is analytical not just descriptive and defended it with many examples, give it an high pass (A or B) and explain why. This is a very good paper. If the author did all of the above adequately but no more than that, had some examples but not a lot, and fulfilled the formal requirements, grade it as a pass/C and explain why. If s/he has a weak conclusion (or none), misses some formal aspects (notes, for example), and is generally weak but can still pass, give it a pass- depending on how weak it is - a pass/D or E. If the author did not do all of the above adequately (no notes, for example, a required co

urse book not used, too few examples/evidence, no original ideas/opinions/conclusions but only a review of the historical events, too short, etc.) and you feel that this paper needs to be redone, give it a fail and explain why. Sign your number. A fail means that the paper does not meet the stated standards. If it is difficult to decide, you may use '+' or '-'.

Turn in 2 (two) copies of the peer review along with the paper. Your review will also be marked, by me, in the ECTS system. **Don't forget your number. Don't forget to turn in the paper along with your review.** One copy of the review will be given to the author of the paper.

If you have any questions, mail me at carole.gillis@klass.lu.se

Good luck!!